DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 219 848 EA 014 766

TITLE	Conferences, Critiques and References on the Subject of "Public and Private Schools": The Coleman Report.
INSTITUTION	National Center for Education Statistics (ED), Washington, DC.
REPORT NO	NCES-82-220
PUB DATE	82
NOTE	12p.; For a related document, see ED 014 598.
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Citations (References); Comparative Analysis; Conferences; Elementary Secondary Education; Opinions; *Private Schools; *Public Schools
IDENTIFIERS	High School and Beyond (NCES); *Public and Private Schools (Coleman et al)

ABSTRACT

A series of analyses of "Public and Private Schools," by James Coleman, Thomas Hoffer, and Sally Kilgore, has appeared in the form of conferences, critical papers, and news stories. This document, containing an extensive listing of commentary on the study, is inteded to serve as a reader's guide to the literature on the subject. Included are references to discussions of major substantive issues, reanalyses of the basic data, and examinations of technical problems of the study as well as news stories, editorials, and other commentary. References are categorized as conferences, critiques, or references, with entries in each section listed in chronological order. (Author/MLF)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED219848

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

CONFERENCES, CRITIQUES AND REFERENCES

ON THE SUBJECT OF

PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SCHOOLS:

THE COLEMAN REPORT

EA 014 766

NCES 82-220

In response to the March 1981 draft of Public and Private Schools by James Coleman, Thomas Hoffer, and Sally Kilgore, a series of analyses of the work appeared in the form of conferences, critical papers, and news stories throughout the media. This document, containing an extensive listing of commentary on the study, may serve as a reader's guide to the literature on this subject. Included are discussions of major substantive issues, reanalyses of the basic data, and examinations of technical problems of the study as well as news stories, editorials, and other commentary. Though not exhaustive, every attempt has been made to include the most important items. Three categories have been used in this presentation: conferences, critiques, and references. In many cases, placement in a category was decided rather arbitrarily. In an effort to make this document as helpful to the reader as possible, entries in each section have been listed in chronological order. In this way, the reader can more easily see how emphasis on different topics shifted as the controversy over the Coleman study unfolded.

I. Conferences

National Center for Education Statistics Policy Seminar. "What Do We Know About Private Schools?" Sponsored by the National Center for Education Statistics in conjunction with the Horace Mann Learning Center, Department of Education, April 1981. 1/

Speakers:

Coleman, James S., Public and Private Schools.
Greeley, Andrew, Minority Students in Catholic Secondary Schools.

Discussants:

Ayars, Albert	Olivas, Michael
Breneman, David W.	Page, Ellis B.
Erickson, Donald A.	Ravitch, Diane
Finn, Chester E., Jr.	Thomas, Gail

American Educational Research Association. Invited Address, Session 16.08, 1981 Annual Meeting, "Public and Private Schools," April 1981. 2/

Speaker:

Coleman, James S., Public and Private Schools.

Discussants:

Braddock, Jomills H. II
Cronbach, Lee J.
Heyns, Barbara L.

"Methodological Considerations Affecting the Credibility of Conclusions: The Instance of Three Conflicting Studies on Public and Private Schools." Conference sponsored by the National Institute of Education, Department of Education, July 1981. 3/

Chair:

Antonoplos, Daniel P.

Participants:

Abramowitz, Susan	Duran, Richard	Migdail, Sherry
Baker, Eva	Forbes, Roy	Miller-Jones, Dalton
Boruch, Robert	Gephart, William J.	Modu, Chris
Braddock, Jomills H. II	Hannaway, Jane	Olneck, Michael
Bryk, Anthony	Kilgore, Sally	Porter, Andrew
Coleman, James S.	Light, Richard	Scriven, Michael
Cooley, William	Linn, Robert	Searls, Donald
	Madow, William	Walberg, Herbert

1/ Copies of transcript available from Educational Resources Information Center, Central ERIC, National Institute of Education, Washington, D.C. 20208.

2/ Tape recording of session available from SPEEDY TAPE, PO Box 39053, Denver, Colorado 80239.

3/ For information on availability of tape recording or transcript of conference, contact Dr. Daniel P. Antonoplos, National Institute of Education, U.S. Department of Education, Washington, D.C. 20208.

"Report of the Meeting of a Panel to Review the Statistical Methodology of the Report Public and Private Schools." Unpublished report. Committee on National Statistics, National Academy of Sciences (Washington, D.C.), July 1981 (meeting), September 1981 (report). 4/

Moderator: Olkin, Ingram

Review panel:

Fienberg, Stephen E.	Madow, William G.
Hansen, Morris H.	Rubin, Donald B.
Jones, Lyle V.	Singer, Burton H.

4/ Report available from Statistical Information Office, National Center for Education Statistics, 1001 Presidential Building, 400 Maryland Ave., SW., Washington, D.C. 20202.

II. Critiques

"Coleman Report on Public and Private Schools: The Draft Summary and Eight Critiques," Educational Research Service (Arlington, Va.), School Research Forum, April 1981.

Commentators:

Campbell, Donald	Krathwohl, David
Crain, Robert L.	Murnane, Richard J.
Kirst, Michael W.	Ravitch, Diane
Klitgaard, Robert	Thomson, Scott D.

Goldberger, Arthur S., "Coleman Goes Private (in Public)," Unpublished paper (draft), Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford, Ca. (May 1981).

Ravitch, Diane, "The Meaning of the New Coleman Report," Phi Delta Kappan 62 (June 1981), pp. 718-720.

Olneck, Michael, "Are Private Schools Better Than Public Schools?: A Critique of the Coleman Report," University of Wisconsin-Madison, Institute for Research on Poverty, Focus 5 (Summer 1981), pp. 1-19.

Stedman, James B., Stephen P. Chilton, and K. Forbis Jordan, "An Analysis of Public and Private Schools (The New Coleman Report)," LB 1603, Congressional Research Service, Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. (August 1981).

Page, Ellis B. and Timothy Z. Keith, "Effects of U.S. Private Schools: A Technical Analysis of Two Recent Claims," Educational Researcher 10 (August/September 1981), pp. 7-17.

Coleman, James S., "Response to Page and Keith," Educational Researcher 10 (August/September 1981), pp. 18-20.

Page, Ellis B., "The Media, Technical Analysis, and the Data Feast: A Response to Coleman," Educational Researcher 10 (August/September 1981), pp. 21-23.

Caldwell, Peggy, "Walking the Perilous Line Between Research and Politics," Education Week 1 (September 7, 1981), p. 7.

Finn, Chester E., Jr., "Trashing the Coleman Report," Education Week 1 (September 7, 1981), p. 24.

Noell, Jay, "The Impact of Private Schools When Self-Selection Is Controlled: A Critique of Coleman's Public and Private Schools," Unpublished paper, Office of Planning, Budget, and Evaluation, Department of Education, Washington, D.C. (September 1981).

Morris, Lorenzo, "'What Do We Know About Private Schools': A Critical Analysis of the NCES Seminar on the Coleman Report." Institute for the Study of Educational Policy (Howard University, Washington, D.C.), ISEP Monitor, September 1981.

Husén, Torsten, "Coleman II - Another Case of Politics and the Professors," Change 13 (September 1981), pp. 11-12.

Brenneman, David W., "Coleman II and the Credibility of Social Science Research," Change 13 (September 1981), p. 13.

Erickson, Donald A., "The Superior Social Climate of Private Schools," Momentum 11 (October 1981), pp. 4-8.

Elford, George, "Self Selection: First a Flaw, Then a Finding," Momentum 11 (October 1981), pp. 8-10.

Sweet, David, "School Effectiveness and Parental Choice of Public and Private Schools," Momentum 11 (October 1981), pp. 11-13.

Coleman, James S., "Quality and Equality in American Education: Public and Catholic Schools," Phi Delta Kappan 63 (November 1981), pp. 159-164.

Four Responses to Coleman, Phi Delta Kappan 63 (November 1981), pp. 164-168.

Kirst, Michael W., "The Rationale for Public Schools."

Braddock, Jomills H. II, "Quality and Equality: Compatible or Incompatible Goals?"

Warner, Carolyn, "Choice Is the Central Issue."

Smith, Donald H., "Finding Beacons of Success."

"Report Analysis, Public and Private Schools," Harvard Educational Review 51 (November 1981), pp. 483-545. Commentary by:

Murnane, Richard J., "Evidence, Analysis, and Unanswered Questions."

Braddock, Jomills H. II. "The Issue Is Still Equality of Educational Opportunity."

Bryk, Anthony S. "Disciplined Inquiry or Policy Argument?"

Finn, Chester E., Jr., "Why Public and Private Schools Matter."

Guthrie, James W. and Ami Zusman, "Unasked Questions."

Heyns, Barbara L. "Policy Implications of the Public and Private School Debates."

Coleman, James S., Thomas Hoffer, and Sally Kilgore, "Questions and Answers: Our Response."

Goldberger, Arthur S., and Glen G. Cain, "The Causal Analysis of Cognitive Outcomes in the Coleman Report," University of Wisconsin-Madison, Institute for Research on Poverty, Discussion Papers, DP#682-81 (December 1981).

James, David R., "Responses to Page and Keith, and Coleman," Letter to the Editor, Educational Researcher 11 (January 1982), pp. 24-25.

Travers, Robert M. W., "Responses to Page and Keith, and Coleman," Letter to the Editor, Educational Researcher 11 (January 1982), p. 25.

Sociology of Education, special issue on Public and Private Schools. Scheduled for April 1982.

III. References

Cohen, Muriel, "Coleman Cites Private Schooling," The Boston Globe, April 3, 1981.

Connell, Christopher, "High Schools," AP Wire, April 3, 1981.

Morgan, Dan, "Private High Schools Are Better than Public, Study Concludes," The Washington Post, April 3, 1981.

"Private Schools Called Better Environment for Students to Learn," The Washington Star, April 4, 1981.

Morgan, Dan, "Fuss over Public vs. Private Schools is Fueled by Federal Studies," The Washington Post, April 4, 1981.

Cohen, Muriel, "Educators Rap Study of Schools," The Boston Globe, April 6, 1981.

Gilliam, Dorothy, "Policies for Destroying the Public Schools," The Washington Post, April 6, 1981.

"New 'Coleman' Report Contests Myths about Private Schools," Education USA, April 6, 1981.

"Private Schools Better than Public Schools, Study Says," Education Daily, April 6, 1981.

"Public Schools, Private Schools," The Washington Post, April 7, 1981.

"School Debate," AP Wire, April 7, 1981.

Hechinger, Fred M., "New Coleman Study Adds to Controversy over Tuition Credit," The New York Times, April 7, 1981.

Dannemeyer, Hon. William E., "Tuition Tax Credits, Vouchers, and the Coleman Study," Congressional Record, April 7, 1981.

Benjamin, Robert, "Report Calling Private High Schools Superior Draws Fire at Conference," The Sun, (Baltimore, Md.), April 8, 1981.

"A New Coleman Report," Pittsburgh Post-Gazette, April 8, 1981.

Feinberg, Lawrence, "Author of Report Says Academic Demands, Behavior Determine Schools' Quality," The Washington Post, April 8, 1981.

Hunter, Marjorie, "New Coleman Study is Defended and Criticized by 500 Educators," The New York Times, April 8, 1981.

"Critics Take Aim at Study Claiming Private Schools Are Better," Education Daily, April 9, 1981.

"Coleman Report II," Wall Street Journal, April 10, 1981.

"Private Schools, Public Duty," The New York Times, April 10, 1981.

Shanker, Albert, "Which Coleman Report Do We Believe," Column Advertisement, The New York Times, April 12, 1981.

Fiske, Edward B., "New School Dispute Stirred by Coleman," The New York Times, April 12, 1981.

"Point-Counterpoint: Researchers Rebut Coleman," Education USA, April 13, 1981.

Williams, Dennis A., with Patricia King, "Private Schools Win a Public Vote," Newsweek, April 13, 1981.

"Coleman II: Schools That Work," The Sun, (Baltimore, Md.), April 13, 1981.

Middleton, Lorenzo, "Coleman Study Says Private Schooling Superior to Public; Social Scientists Attack His Findings," The Chronicle of Higher Education, April 13, 1981.

"Cynicism for a 'Scientific' Report," National School Boards Association, School Board News, April 13, 1981.

"Schools and Mythology," The Washington Star, April 15, 1981.

"Coleman Finds Private Schools Best," Report on Education Research, April 15, 1981.

Coleman, James S., "It's How Private Schools Are Better That Counts," Letter to the Editor, The New York Times, April 19, 1981.

Comer, James P., "Coleman's Bad Report," The New York Times, April 19, 1981.

Ravitch, Diane, "The Way to Make Public Schools Good," The Washington Post, April 19, 1981.

Shanker, Albert, "Time to Ship Out the Violent Students," Column Advertisement, The New York Times, April 19, 1981.

Finn, Chester E., Jr., "Schools: Private vs. Public," Daily News (New York), April 19, 1981.

"Can Public Learn from Private?" Time, April 20, 1981.

"The Coleman Report: Researchers Project How $1,000 Increase in Family Income Would Affect Private School Enrollment," Education Times, April 20, 1981.

"High Marks for Private Schools," U.S. News and World Report, April 20, 1981.

"Researchers Blast Coleman 'Bumper Sticker' Mentality," Education USA, April 20, 1981.

"Feds Should Encourage Selection of Private Schools, Coleman Says," Education Daily, April 23, 1981.

Shanker, Albert, "Good Schools Put Pressure on Students," Column Advertisement, The New York Times, April 26, 1981.

Fiske, Edward B., "School Study Said to Fail to Emphasize Main Point," The New York Times, April 26, 1981.

"Report: Private Schools Better than Public," Robert Kennedy Memorial Foundation (Washington, D.C.), Youth Policy, April 1981.

Hechinger, Fred M., "Professor Coleman's Troubles," The New York Times, May 11, 1981.

"Study Praising Private Schools Condemned by Researchers," Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law, Federal Education Project (Washington, D.C.), Newsletter, May 1981.

"Coleman Makes Case for Tuition Aid," American Association of School Administrators, Federal Focus, May 1981.

"Public and Private Schools: How They Compare," Americans United for Separation of Church and State (Silver Spring, Md.), Church and State, May 1981.

Coleman, James S., "Schools of Thought," The New York Times, June 20, 1981.

"Research Is Always 'Political' in D.C.," Phi Delta Kappan 62 (June 1981), p. 693.

"Coleman Report Misses the Point," The American School Board Journal 168 (June 1981), pp. 8-9.

"Coleman Report Gives Comfort to Proponents of Tuition Tax Credits," The American School Board Journal 168 (June 1981), p. 40.

Bazar, Joan, "Coleman Study Spurs Policy Debate at AERA," American Psychological Association Monitor (June/July 1981).

"Once More unto the Breach," American Education (June 1981).

Wefing, Henry, "Duke Prof: School Study in Error," Durham Morning Herald (Durham, N.C.), July 2, 1981.

Shanker, Albert, "Pittsburgh Priest Challenges Coleman," Column Advertisement, The New York Times, July 19, 1981.

"Page Says Coleman Report is Wrong," Report on Education Research, July 22, 1981.

Shanker, Albert, "Another Attack on the Coleman Report," Column Advertisement, The New York Times, July 26, 1981.

"Critics Attack Latest Coleman Report," National School Boards Association, The Executive Educator, July 1981.

Coleman, James S., "The Public Interest and Private Schools," The Washington Star, August 2, 1981.

"Public vs. Private School Debate Continues on Capitol Hill," Education Daily, September 17, 1981.

"Coleman Report 'Just Plain Wrong': Ellis Page," Phi Delta Kappan 63 (September 1981), p. 74.

Eldridge, Marie D., "Missing the Point," Letter to the Editor, The American School Board Journal 168 (September 1981), p. 3.

Eldridge, Marie D., "Coleman and the NCES," Letter to the Editor, Phi Delta Kappan 63 (October 1981), p. 148.

"Private School Studies Miss Point, Another Says," Education USA, November 2, 1981.